



Dalberg Research

DRIVING INNOVATION IN DIGITAL AGRICULTURE: EXPLORING THE USE OF DIGITAL SOLUTIONS TO ADDRESS FINANCIAL AND INFORMATION GAPS FOR SMALLHOLDER FARMERS AND PASTORALISTS IN KENYA

SUMMARY FINDING

**JUNE 2023** 



This material has been funded by UK aid from the UK government; however th views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK government's official policies.

Dalberg Research

Photo credits to Christian Muhindo

### 1) Introduction

- 2) Study Background & Objectives
- 3) Smallholder, Agropastoralist and Pastoralist Profiles

4) DIS

5) DFS

6) Challenges and Opportunities

7) Gap Analysis



### Supporting Pactoralism

Supporting Pastoralism and Agriculture in Recurrent and Protracted Crises



Dalberg Research











### BACKGROUND & OBJECTIVES

### Study Methodology & Objectives

This study employed purely secondary research by triangulating publications, journals, white papers and other credible literatures from credible agriculture stakeholders and research organizations.

The findings were supported by analysis of proprietary datasets from different Public, Private and Nongovernmental institutions.

The objective to this study was to:

1) Conduct in-depth profiling of smallholder farmers, agropastoralist and pastoralists, through studying the value chains they participate in and how they access and use Digital Financial Services (DFS) and/or Digital Information services (DIS)

2) Interrogate existing information on access and utilization of DFS and/or DIS, exploring opportunities to enhance information sharing and adoption by producers



Source: Note: The literature considered to generate insights in this study was seven years old as opposed to five years required due to effect of COVID 19 which hampered data collection efforts.

### **Definition of terms**

**Digital Financial Services (DFS)** refers to the use of digital technologies such as mobile phones, the internet, and other electronic devices to deliver financial services. DFS includes services such as mobile banking, mobile money transfers, online payments, and other electronic financial transactions. These services are aimed at increasing financial inclusion by providing affordable, convenient, and secure financial services to individuals who have limited access to traditional banking services<sup>1</sup>

**Digital Information Services (DIS)** refers to the delivery of information and knowledge to individuals or organizations through digital channels, such as mobile phones and the internet. DIS can include weather updates, market prices, agricultural advice, and other relevant content that can improve decision-making processes and livelihoods, particularly for those living in remote or underserved areas<sup>2</sup>

**AGRIFIN** 

### Digital Financial Services (DFS)

### Digital Information Services (DIS)

MERCY



Dalberg Research

Source: <sup>1</sup>Digital Financial Services (DFS) | Alliance for Financial Inclusion (afi-global.org); <sup>2</sup>How digital technologies can help Africa's smallholder farmers | E-Agriculture (fao.org)

















### SMALLHOLDER, AGROPASTORALIST AND PASTORALIST PROFILES

### Smallholder farming is mainly practiced in the Central and Western regions, while pastoralism is common in ASAL Region

#### Distribution of smallholder farms over agroclimatic zones



#### Map of ASAL and Non ASAL counties in Kenya



The agro-climatic zones of Kenya are based on temperature and precipitation ranges within which the main crops can flourish and the probability of these zones meeting the temperature and water requirements of the leading crops. These zones give an estimate of the climatic yield potential.

Source: Geoscience Landscape Portal; World Resource Institute Notes: \*This coverage does not include information on the non cultivated (pastoralist) areas

## SHF operate in areas with better market accessibility as compared to pastoral communities





Travel time to markets in Pastoral community



Access to markets has been cited as one of the challenges to agricultural productivity, access to financial institutions in Kenya among small holder farmers and pastoral communities.



Source: Malaria Atlas Project, Open Street Maps and LOCAN Analysis

Market

## ... Pastoralist operate in food-insecure which at times can affect priorities in the digital solutions

**Current/ Projected acute malnutrition** 

#### **Current/ Projected acute food insecurity**



The food security data was derived using satellite data measuring precipitation anomalies, vegetation anomalies (Normalized Vegetation Index - NDVI) and expert opinion based on knowledge of market and trade functioning systems. **Turkana**, **Mandera** and **Wajir** are on the lead, collectively contributing **57%**, more than half of malnourished pregnant and lactating women.

Total counties under ASAL counties as per the IPC report are 23

-ocation

Source; Ministry of East African Community (EAC), The ASALS and Regional Sevelopment. Feed the Future, The accelerated value chain development program national conference report 2018, The Famine Early Warning Systems Network (FEWS and Integrated Food Security Phase Classification (IPC)

ЛERCУ

**AGRIFIN** 

https://www.asals.go.ke/asal-info/#:~:text=ASALs%20Categorization&text=It%20is%20home%20to%20about,high%20rates%20of%20evapo%2Dtranspiration; https://www.ipcinfo.org/fileadmin/user\_upload/ipcinfo/docs/IPC\_Kenya\_Acute\_Food\_Insecurity\_Acute\_MaInutrition\_2021FebMay\_ASAL.pdf

SPARC

**Dalbero** Research

## Smallholder farming is dominated by non-youth; Smallholder farmers are fairly educated compared to pastoralists





Source; Agrifin accelerate, Benchmark study of smallholder farmers of Kenya, 2015; MercyCorps: Comparative Analysis of Smallholder Farmers in Kenya, Zambia And Tanzania , 2017; Gender productivity differentials among smallholder farmers in Africa, 2015. Notes: Central counties included Kiambu, Kirinyaga, Murang'a, Nyandarua, Nyeri. Western counties included Bungoma, Busia, Kakamega, Vihiga

### Male SHFs earn around double the average income of female SHFs.



#### Monthly income of SHFs by gender and education



Source; Agrifin accelerate, Benchmark study of smallholder farmers of Kenya, 2015; MercyCorps: Comparative Analysis of Smallholder Farmers in Kenya, Zambia And Tanzania , 2017; Gender productivity differentials among smallholder farmers in Africa, 2015. Notes: Central counties included Kiambu, Kirinyaga, Murang'a, Nyandarua, Nyeri. Western counties included Bungoma, Busia, Kakamega, Vihiga

# SHFs are involved in mixed farming with cattle rearing and growing food crops being the most

- Apiculture and aquaculture are the least common value chains among SHFS; this could be attributed to high initial and maintenance costs incurred in setting up the beehives and fish cages/ponds
- Traditional value chains like Sorghum, Millet, Cassava are underdeveloped across multiple SHFs
- SHFs who grow Tea, Coffee and Sugar cane as their primary crops do not intercrop

#### SHFs Value chains (n=2005)

% of the value chains that SHFs are involved in



Food crops cultivated SHFs (n=562)

% of SHFs who cultivate specific food crops

Source; MercyCorps: Comparative Analysis of Smallholder Farmers in Kenya, Zambia And Tanzania , 2017; AgriFin accelerate, Benchmark study of smallholder farmers of Kenya, 2015

Notes; Other livestock includes poultry (chicken, ducks, turkeys and geese); Others include vegetables such as black nightshade (managu), spider plant (sagaa), amaranth.

# Cattle, goats, and sheep are the most common value chains among agropastoralist and pastoralist

Distribution of households rearing livestock value chains across arid counties in Kenya

Proportion of households practicing livestock rearing within arid counties by type of livestock



SPARC

Source: ILRI Research Report, Kenya Population and Housing Census, 2019

Pastoralism Value Chain

Notes; Exotic cattle include both dairy and beef cattle. Others include exotic chicken layers and broilers and indigenous chicken.

Dalberg Research

**AGRIFIN** 











### DIGITAL FINANCIAL SERVICES

## Formal agri-finance access is generally lower among SHF, with limited access for women compared to men

- Further studies have indicated that , women in rural areas struggle with access to formal funding for agriculture due to a lack of collateral and limited decision-making power. This forces them to turn to informal finance sources. Men on the flip side have higher access to formal, responsible agri-loans
- Addressing these barriers through initiatives and policies promoting gender equality is important for improving women's access to financial services in agriculture.



Source: FSD Kenya (FinAccess 2021): Agriculture and Processing Financing Market Analysis , 2022; 1KIPPRA, Women's Access to Agricultural Finance in Kenya: Baseline Report, 2019 Notes: KIPPRA – Kenya Institute of Public Policy Research and Analysis: General saving refer to saving in different channels inclusive social network, ROSCAS, ASCA's, VSLA's

## Women are twice as likely as men to secure funds through social networks

#### Sources of Funds for Financing Agricultural Operations by Gender (n= 5308)

Smallholder



Source: FSD Kenya (FinAccess 2021), Agriculture and Processing Financing Market Analysis , 2022; 1KIPPRA, Women's Access to Agricultural Finance in Kenya: Baseline Report, 2019

## Among the pastoralist, more male-headed households own a bank account than their female counterparts



- Majority of the pastoralists feel they don't have adequate money to keep in the bank, lack regular income or unable to afford bank services as well as low literacy levels and thus the reason for being underserved on banking services
- Male headed pastoral households added other reasons for not saving as; it was more costly than other sharia compliant options

**SPARC** 

Source: ILRI- De-Risking, Inclusion, And Value Enhancement of Pastoral Economies in the Horn of Africa (DRIVE) Report, 2022; WFP, Humanitarian Aid and Civil Protection, & GoK. (2013). Market Dynamics and Financial Services in Kenya's Arid Lands; IGAD, Stock-Taking and Gap Analysis Study of Financial Products for Pastoral Areas and Linking Pastoralists to Financial Service Providers, 2016 – Qualitative analysis, UKaid & CGIAR, 2021 Notes: n = 187, VSLA - Village Savings and Lending Associations

Dalberg Research

**AGRIFIN** 

## Savings in female and male-headed households is comparable; females prefer MOMO and home savings, while males choose





Channels used to save by gender

MERCY

% of pastoralists using specific saving channel

**AGRIFIN** 

- Savings through banks is more than 3x among male headed households compared to female headed households. Females were ~2 time saving on mobile money or at home when compared to the males
- Further, results of the study also show that in more than three-quarters of the households that have a bank account, it is registered on a man's name compared with women.

**SPARC** 

Source: ILRI- De-Risking, Inclusion, And Value Enhancement of Pastoral Economies in the Horn of Africa (DRIVE) Report; n = 187

Dalberg Research











### DIGITAL INFORMATION SERVICES

## SHFs access agricultural advisory services mostly through low-tech methods

- Mainstream media (TV and radio) is the most prevalent source of information among majority of SHFs<sup>1</sup> and even among the older farmers (35+). This group of farmers tend to feel more comfortable with information rendered by low-tech methods (radio, TV, other farmers and agricultural officers)
- The study further noted that word of mouth (other farmers and agricultural officers) is still commonly used to gather agricultural information by the **Sources of Agricultural Advice (n=900)**

% of SHFs who accessed agricultural advice through digital extension and advisory services



Source: GeoPoll, A study of Kenya's agricultural sector: the effect of mobile technology on farming in modern Kenya, 2018; 1Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), HEP, 2021-Challenges And Capacity Gaps In Smallholder Access To Digital Extension And Advisory Services In Kenya And Uganda

SPARC

Dalberg Research

**AGRIFIN** 

### Most of the SHFs have access to digital extension and advisory services; this is mainly through radio, TV and cellphone

- Even though the SHFs have access to digital extension and advisory services, non-digital extension approaches have remained dominant. Integrating faceto-face and digital methods can enhance inclusive scaling of extension services
- Radio commands the dispatch of digital extension and advisory services to the SHFs; this is attributed to the widespread of radio ownership among the SHFs than other digital devices
- Female and elderly farmers are more likely to report challenges associated with farming practices as opposed to their counterparts

### Access to digital extension and advisory services



Source; Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), HEP, 2021- Challenges And Capacity Gaps In Smallholder Access To Digital Extension and Advisory Services In Kenya And Uganda, n = 436

#### Access to digital extension and advisory services

% channels of extension and advisory services

### The influence of extension officers on information accessed by SHF's in inputs cannot be underrated Farmers' information sources for the choice and amount of inputs is based on trust and familiarity with other stakeholders



Farmers noted that they can get the information on best farming practices from the following sources



#### Implication

AgriTech need to leverage the influence of extension officers to promote their services.

**AGRIFIN** 

ЛERCУ

One of the agro-dealers was quoted saying, "Once the farmers have been advised by the extension officers it is very hard to change their mind".

#### Extension officers advise farmers on the best variety of seeds to plant for their region and how to tend to them.

- Farmers also cited self-experience from previous seasons and observation of other successful farmers as sources of reliable information to choose inputs.
- Agri techs were cited as a source of farming news and farming tips by 9.2% of the farmers interviewed.
- Most farmers admitted to knowing the right guality and quantity of input even when they did not manage to use them due to economic constraints.





### Dalberg Research

# Radio is the most prevalent digital device used by SHFs to access agricultural advice

Sources of Agricultural Advice

Smallholder

% of SHFs who accessed agricultural advice through digital extension and devices

Type of information that SHFs sought - by TV/Radio -

- by phone

% of SHFs who seek specific type of agricultural information



Source; Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), HEP, 2021- Challenges And Capacity Gaps In Smallholder Access To Digital Extension And Advisory Services In Kenya And Uganda, International Journal of language and linguistics; Role of Television in Communicating Agricultural Information: the Case of Citizen Television's Shamba Shape up Programme in Kenya

# Various sources of information on livestock are available although Radio/TV and traditional methods are the

• Pastoral households primarily access information about livestock marketing through their social network of relatives and friends and community gatherings, while weather forecasts are mainly obtained from radio and television broadcasts.

#### Sources of information by pastoralist households



Source: ILRI- De-Risking, Inclusion, And Value Enhancement of Pastoral Economies in the Horn of Africa (DRIVE) Report; African Research and Economic Development Consultants (AFREDEC), 2022. ILRI, USAID Kenya Accelerated Value Chain Development Program (AVCD)-Livestock component, Analysis of livestock and fodder value chains in arid and semi-arid lands in Kenya, 2018; ILRI, CGIAR, CTA, Exploring pastoralists' demand for information and channels for its effective delivery, 2018.











## CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES IN DIS AND DFS ADOPTION

### Producers in Kenya face various factors that hinder the adoption and utilization of DIS/DFS including infrastructural and capacity



Lack of digital literacy and technical skills: Although SHF education. have better manv agropastoralits pastoralists lack basic diaital literacy and technical skills, which hinder their ability to use and fully utilize digital financial services.



Limited access to digital infrastructure: Many rural and remote areas, lack reliable and affordable access to digital infrastructure, such as internet connectivity, power, and mobile devices.



Lack of trust and understanding of digital financial services: Many pastoralists and agro-pastoralists are not familiar with digital financial services and may have limited understanding of their benefits and risks. This lack of trust and understanding can limit their willingness to use these services.



Perceptions, socio-cultural and gender barriers: Socio-cultural and gender norms in pastoralist communities may discourage women and other marginalized groups from accessing and using digital financial services.







services: Undeveloped products taking care of sharia compliance are available in the market among pastoralists, flexible payment plan on loans based on maturity period of crop among others

Lack of relevant and tailored products and

High costs of digital financial services: The costs associated with digital financial services, including transaction fees and the cost of digital devices e.g., smartphone. And airtime to buy bundles



S

AGRIFIN

**0:**D

Insufficient awareness and outreach: There is often a limited awareness and outreach efforts by providers and regulators to educate pastoralists and agro-pastoralists about digital financial services, their benefits, and how to use them effectively.

**barrier:** Many pastoralists Language speak indigenous languages, but information is often only available in English or Swahili, making it difficult for them to access relevant information and services

Dalberg Research

Source; International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), Annual Report, 2019; United Nations Capital Development Fund (UNCDF), Regulating the Use of Digital Financial Service Agents in Developing Countries, 2015; World Bank, Kenya Economic Update, 2020; Bett, Information and Communications Technologies (ICTs) and Livelihoods Enhancement in Agro-Pastoral Communities in Kenya, 2022; Mugo et al. Pastoralists and digital information access: An exploratory study from northern Kenya, 2019.

٦.

# Pastoral counties in northern and eastern Kenya, have poor infrastructure to support cell phone and internet



Source: GSMA, Kenya National Bureau of Statistics, 2019 and LOCAN Analysis

Pastoralist

ø

Agropastoralist

Livestock rearing counties selected based on:- P176517-DRIVE-Project-Kenya-Environmental-and-Social-Management-Framework-ESMF-July-13-2022, page 14

## Network coverage among Smallholder counties is well distributed except for the lower eastern regions

Network coverage among SHFs, 2021

Level of digital penetration



## While crop pest and disease management information was highly sought after, nearly half of SHFs identified information gaps

### Difficult information to be accessed by SHFs

#### % of SHFs by type of information

And Advisory Services In Kenya And Uganda



### Information gaps



SPARC

Source; Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), HEP, 2021 - Challenges And Capacity Gaps In Smallholder Access To Digital Extension

31

# Among SHFs, utilization of mobile money grew by more than 2x between 2019 and 2021

Cash payments deny farmers and agricultural produce buyers the opportunity to generate bankable data that can support FSPs in their credit underwriting.

**SPARC** 

Mobile money usage to receive farm related payments

% SHFs who use mobile money to receive farm related payments



Source; FSD, Agriculture-and-Processing-Financing-Market-Analysis (2021). Notes; The payments mentioned are on how SHFs agricultural households receive farm related payments



Mobile money usage to make farm related payments

# Globally according to Fintech report 2016, some of key market growth drivers and challenges of DFS are ...









Source: Fintech report, 2016

Dalberg Research

### A case study conducted between 2007-2017 among agro-pastoral households showed improved savings upon financial training



#### Household saving channels in West Pokot



Source; Bostedt et al., Saving and borrowing behavior among agro-pastoralists in West Pokot County, Kenya, 2021. Panel data by NGO Vi Agroforestry between 2007 and 2017. Note: Training is offered by some financial institutions. The question had a 3rd answer option as "No answer", Informal - (merry-go-round, table banking, VSL etc.), VSL-Village saving and lending; n= 310

Saving with training on financial matters













### **GAP ANALYSIS**

# The literature research and data analysis surfaces the following gaps

Theme	Identified Gaps
Digital Financial Service	<ul> <li>Despite the growth of digital financial services in Kenya, there is limited data on the financial behavior and practices of producers especially in the most remote areas.</li> <li>There is limited information that quantifies the amounts in saving, borrowed, requested and granted loans and utility of funds across gender, age or education levels among the producers</li> <li>There is limited research on the experiences and needs of smallholder farmers from underrepresented communities, including women and marginalized groups, which limits our understanding of the challenges they face in accessing financial service</li> <li>While there is some evidence that DFS and DIS can improve the livelihoods of smallholder farmers, there is limited research on the long-term impact of these services.</li> <li>There is limited quantitative studies on cyber security concerns among farmers which can reduce perceived risks and lack of confidence on digital systems</li> </ul>



## The literature research and data analysis surfaces the following gaps cont.'

Theme	Identified Gaps
Digital Information Services	<ul> <li>Information on how producers have been able to use information accessed to solve problems like disaster preparedness is limited</li> </ul>
	• Digital Literacy: Many producers, especially the older farmers or those with limited education, may have low levels of digital literacy. This can make it difficult for them to navigate digital platforms, access online information, and fully utilize digital tools and resources.
	• Language and content packaging: As the producers have lower education and literacy, not much effort is in place to understand how much influence tailored products that fits local language and context can blend with digital content sharing
	• Most of the literature and datasets available do not uniquely identify agro-pastoralists as a key segment across all themes hence proper classification is required during data collection and analysis.
	<ul> <li>Most studies on pastoralism was structured on case studies as opposed to representative sample or a census</li> </ul>

